

## **MARIN CONSERVATION LEAGUE**

### **Climate Action Working Group: November 16, 2018**

#### **Muir Woods Conference Room, 175 N. Redwood Blvd., San Rafael**

Present: Chairman Doug Wilson; Bob Miller, Belle Cole, Roger Roberts, Ed Mainland, Pat Nelson, Tamra Peters, Bill Carney, Nancy Bell, James Bill, Ken Strong, Andrea Taylor, Sarah Loughran, Naomi Tatarsky-Bridges, Daisy Carlson, Tom Flynn, Greg Thomson, Richard Gray, Veronica Pearson, Sue Saunders, Annika Osborn, Lawrie Mott, Carleen Cullen, Pam Reaves, Susan Stompe, Kurt Johnson, Kate Powers, Barb Boylan, Dan Segedin, Monica DiLillo.

Guest Speaker: Abby Young, Manager, Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD) Climate Protection Program.

Chairman Doug Wilson called the meeting to order at 9:06.

#### **Brief Introductions**

**Agenda and minutes approved by consensus.**

#### **9:10 Discussion 1: Overview of BAAQMD activities and grant program (Abby Young)**

Chairman Doug Wilson introduced Abby Young and outlined the interactive procedure for CAWG discussions. He noted that there are BAAQMD proposals currently before the County.

Abby introduced herself and stated that she would begin by telling us about the BAAQMD and move on to describe new initiatives.

The BAAQMD came into being in 1955. It was the first local air district in the country. Currently, BAAQMD is one of 35 local air districts in California. There are 400 people on the staff at BAAQMD. The tasks they work on include regulation, permitting, conducting science and research, formulating grants and incentives, outreach, monitoring, etc.

The agency has evolved to consider issues beyond its traditional air pollution role. It is attentive to emerging critical issues, some of which are focused above or below the regional level. BAAQMD is a public health agency addressing the problem of disproportionately impacted communities and equity, as well as global climate pollution and the Bay Area's contribution to the problem. Abby's team coordinates and works with local governments.

#### **Questions and Comments**

Doug: How has the state legislation regarding GHGs played out at BAAQMD? A. Cap and Trade has been reauthorized. The reauthorization legislation stated that local air districts may not regulate CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from sources covered by Cap and Trade.

Doug: This was a compromise with the oil companies.

Abby: Items that remain within BAAQMD's regulatory authority includes generators, boilers, etc.; and fast-growing regional climate pollutants other than CO<sub>2</sub>, such as methane, fluorinated gases. We are also working with local governments on the regional approach to fossil fuel combustion—going beyond the regulatory to address issues such as the decarbonization of buildings. AB 617 addresses communities that are highly affected by local pollution. It provides for local monitoring stations and community engagement. West Oakland is one example. This entails a shift in focus at the air district, a big internal shift.

Doug: What about Marin? A. The district gives out millions of dollars in grants, usually related to transportation. Occasionally we use general funds—for example, when MCE was founded. We distributed \$4.5 million in grant funds last year. Grants are awarded in two categories: reducing GHGs from existing buildings, and 2. fostering innovative strategies with long-term impacts in reducing GHG emissions. Existing buildings are a tough nut to crack, a legacy with slow turnover. New buildings are easier to address: We seek to go deep and broad, get fossil fuel out of buildings and encourage innovation—to incubate game-changing ideas.

Project funding includes \$400,000 to the Bay Area Regional Energy Network (BayREN) a collaboration of the nine Bay Areas counties led by the Association of Bay Area Governments. BayREN implements energy saving programs on a regional level and will develop a program to use electric hot water heat pumps instead of natural gas water heaters. Marin has received one grant of approximately \$300,000 for a pilot project to promote the decarbonization of buildings. This includes incentives for homeowners and training for personnel, addressing both demand- and supply-side. Heat pump water heaters will be a focus. The objective is to jump-start the market. Marin County, working in conjunction with other jurisdictions also has been awarded \$206,000 to develop marketing and model policies to promote the development of climate-friendly cement in construction. Another grant that has relevance to Marin is a grant of \$263,000 to the Alameda County Waste Management Authority to develop technical specs and model policies to reduce contamination in compost.

Belle: Considering the forum on fire and climate change, what does the research indicate re reducing smoke-related health hazards? A. The district's Public Health Officer is on top of this research. Q. Will you put out a report? A. I will check. Researchers at UC Berkeley and Stanford are studying the issue. STI is doing modeling concerning last year's wildfires: what happened, what is the impact of particulate matter.

Abby (cont.): Re the grant program, there is a list on the BAAQMD website. In the government climate summit, the district initiated the "Diesel-Free by '33" campaign, which requested that local government officials and business leaders from all over the world sign on to a Statement of Purpose to cut diesel use to zero by the end of 2033. The district is now creating a program to integrate these efforts in the areas of climate programs, grants, and technology, addressing the problem at the neighborhood as well as the global level.

Sarah: What are the largest sources of diesel emissions? A. Heavy-duty trucking along the I-80 and I-580 corridors, and in areas where the topography results in emissions settling.

Roger: What about bio-diesel?

Kate: Does the SMART train use diesel? A. Yes. Kate: Scoping comments are due Monday for the Downtown San Rafael SMART extension and transit center relocation. A. The district is looking at it.

Kate: San Rafael is updating its General Plan and Climate Action Plan. Elements of the General Plan don't have teeth. How do we exert influence to obtain climate-friendly infrastructure and meaningful sea-level-rise adaptation? How can the agency exert influence? A. I will check regarding the district's intent to comment. The Air District is in the process of updating significance thresholds for GHGs.

Pam: What about post-2020? What is the threshold, and how will you give guidance? Numerical thresholds are easy to game. Best-practice requirements are harder to game. A. We are looking at the County Climate Action Plan, making comments by phone, then may make written comments—I will check in with Christine O'Rourke.

Ken: Where are the monitoring stations? A. In San Rafael. They do not monitor GHGs. We also conduct research re traffic corridors, park research vans with monitoring equipment. Q. Are they parked in Marin? A. I will check.

Tamra: Regarding decarbonization grants, are decarbonization rules piggybacked on BayREN? A. Yes, that is the goal. We are working on training. Resilient Neighborhoods is a partner.

Ken: Particulate matter reaches high levels around hills in the Bay Area. Diesel is the biggest source. The biggest industrial source is oil refineries, and there is no rule requiring wet scrubbers at refineries. We are hoping for a rule. A. There is a work-around for the restrictions imposed by the recent cap-and-trade legislation—we can still regulate for particulate matter. Ken: 350 Bay Area has been working on that approach—AB 398.

Bob: Which jurisdiction has the most innovative Climate Action Plan? Is there a way to disseminate innovation? A. That's a frequent question, and is difficult to answer. All plans have strong and weak points. The district has an Excel database for all plans, that allows searching and sharing and staff review. Five years ago, San Rafael had one of the best building sections. Some plans focus on renewable energy, waste, water, etc.

Bob: Is there a real attempt to find a no-cost alternative? A. We don't force action. Bob: Do any jurisdictions go beyond and implement requirements with teeth. A. Most plans have policies; most have mostly no teeth. What are teeth: ordinances, policies with incentives? The Climate Action Plan is a tool to achieve a goal. Look at the CAP and see whether it will do the job.

Q. Does the district have EV charging programs? A. We have a streamlined, simplified application process. Sometimes assistance in acquiring EVs themselves—helping lower-income families purchase them.

Doug: That's primarily regarding multi-family housing.

Q. Are you coordinating with MCE? A. We speak with CCAs, are working on model ordinances, addressing gaps in the building code update.

Ed: Can the cities access the database? A. Not yet. That is the goal. We're Beta testing now.

Sarah: Are there barriers to addressing refinery emissions? A. (Richard): The district makes plans. Get them moved up in priority. Get on the regulatory calendar. There will be political pressure in the coming year. A. (Abby): The district has many requirements as to how to move forward on regulation.

Doug: Are you familiar with Marin Drawdown? Their No. 2 priority is transportation. A. In 2018, there was \$100 million for transportation grants.

Q. What is the best way to engage with the process? A. Most funds are not discretionary. Focus on public agencies. Air your concerns in partnership with MTC.

Bill and Doug: Methane and AC. How do we get more focus on AC and heat-pump furnaces? We're not ready for market demand to carry that function. A. Heat-pump furnaces and water heaters are becoming less expensive. Training completes the chain. There are lots of different heating and cooling demands in the Bay Area. Hot water demand is more constant. The Palo Alto municipal utility replaces furnaces in multi-family housing.

Daisy: Are there passive ventilation grants? A. Ask the architect if you can retrofit in a redesign. Existing housing was designed for an older climate; the future will be more cooling-dominated. This requires major work. Daisy: Are you looking a bio-mimicry? A. Night-cooling is a strategy. Daisy: Is there anything in the works concerning research? A. No, for the Air District. In the architectural field, look beyond now.

Tom: Is the Air Resources Board emphasis on dairies and wood stoves working? A. The wood stove issue is opening up again, with bigger subsidies for electric. [Comment, Richard]: Incentives are a natural—heat pumps.] A. (cont.): Regarding dairies, methane emissions are dominated by landfills. These emissions are not measured well; they are modeled. The climate group is conducting regional GHG monitoring, using planes and vans to measure methane. They partner with NASA on infrared, to determine where the leaks and emissions are. Dairies are a big issue. Dairies in Marin are too small to take advantage of state resources. We've had conversations with Strauss and the Carbon Cycle Institute.

Richard: Electric heat pumps and air conditioning are low-hanging fruit. Do you have a model ordinance on that subject or other subjects? A. We do not have a heat pump ordinance. We have one on requiring PV solar on new construction. That will be superseded if local requirements are more stringent. We do cost analysis, have provided models.

Ed: Is it possible to think of dairies as a collective? A. It would be good to think of them in that way concerning pilot projects or grants. I'm not sure regarding state funding. That's an appropriate topic to work on.

## **10:10 Discussion 2: MCE 2019 Integrated Resource Plan (Bob Miller)**

Doug introduced the discussion, noting that CAWG members have been attending MCE technical committee meetings on innovative programs such as energy efficiency and EVs. CAWG is continuing this approach and recently attended the meeting concerning MCE's new Integrated Resources Plan. A link is embedded in the agenda. CAWG will pursue this issue further.

Bob: The Integrated Resources Plan is an important document. The purpose of the document is to quantify energy demand over a 10-year period and to determine how to meet that demand. The 2019-2028 period is key to achieving the dual goals of reducing GHG emissions and maintaining competitive rates.

MCE estimates that they will achieve the goal of being 100% GHG-free by 2022, and that they will be utilizing 70% renewable energy in 10 years.

Both the 2018 and 2019 Integrated Resources Plans both address renewable energy and GHG goals. The difference between the 2018 and 2019 plans is that the 2019 plan includes more hydro, which is not scalable. Do we care? Yes, because this means that Marin is adding less to the state's renewable capacity. There is less pressure to innovate. Pending issues require creativity. DER (distributed energy resources), cutting down on peak demand, shifting demand from high-price times, energy efficiency, and higher levels of renewables are crucial to the goal of lowering GHGs. MCE also wants stability.

Marin has been on the cutting edge of the CCA movement. The question is whether MCE will be in the forefront going forward. Targets for DER are modest and cautious. Will there be a push for MCE to go beyond current achievements? Will MCE invest money and staff time? Marin accounts for a tiny fraction of demand, but is a wealthy county that can serve as a model.

Ken: Lots of CCAs have hydro components. If we pull all new renewable development here, what does that mean to other areas? A. MCE is using hydro for competitive reasons. MCE is competing on the basis of GHG-free, and hydro is cheaper than other options.

Ed: Bob hit the nail on the head. Of the 19 CCAs, MCE is falling behind. They should bring in best practices. CAWG should have a presentation regarding DER planning, inviting MCE and the East Bay CCA. MCE does not have a specific DER plan.

Daisy: PG&E has a 30% nuke plan. Will its nuclear sources be decommissioned, leading to a shift to hydro? Would that be a challenging position for CCAs?

Carleen: We have to keep pushing MCE to innovate and to invest in EVs, etc. What does it look like from an economic perspective? A. MCE has valid competitive reasons for its position: price/revenue/resource allocation.

Doug: We invited MCE to today's meeting, but they were unable to attend due to air quality concerns.

Comment: The goal of electrifying everything is good, but time-of-use (TOU) is important. Night charging is done with natural gas.

Roger: Is MCE working on storage? A. Yes.

Greg: MCE has a \$1 million grant to design a model DER plan for the state. Doug: It's a creative proposal.

Kate: Climate change is also changing the water cycle. This could affect reliance on hydro? What are the impacts?

## Announcements

Doug: 1) There is a proposal to install 11,000 solar units near Redwood Landfill and the freeway. This will have a big visual impact and MCL will address it in the Land Use Committee. 2) There will be a CCA summit in San Francisco on November 28-30. The cost is \$95.

Ed: At this event, there will be a panel on innovation.

Doug (cont.): Drawdown Marin meets today regarding energy at 1:00 – 5:00. That is the first prong; then transportation, followed by the built environment.

Ken: Will they send invites? A. Today's meeting is not a public meeting, but it's not closed.

Bill: Will you help move forward the noticing process for public meetings? A. (Doug): Yes.

## Reports

**Resilient Neighborhoods (Tamra).** The smoke from the wildfires and the IGPP Report have been motivating factors in Resilient Neighborhood's effort to help reduce the residential carbon footprint and promote resilience. We currently have 48 households in the program. We are hosting more teams in one venue. We have another Resilient Offices team, and City of Novato and City of San Rafael want to do it. We will conduct a "2020 Challenge." Resilient Neighborhoods is also looking at shorter components for the program. We are harnessing the energy of grads and will be extending our focus to multi-family housing, church and women's clubs, and senior co-housing, where cooks are considering a plant-based diet.

Doug: Cool Hive is a resource and promotes Resilient Neighborhoods. If anyone has articles regarding projects, submit them to Daisy.

**350 Bay Area. (Richard).** Tomorrow the Air District will conduct a retreat addressing environmental justice, a combustion strategy, and reducing particulate matter and GHGs. Janet Stromberg will speak. Rich Karas from Communities for a Better Environment will discuss decommissioning refineries—how to accomplish this via land use authority.

Andrea: There was a public event a week ago concerning public banking. Also a rally for the Children's Climate Lawsuit. An internship has been funded, and there may be one or two more.

Put the word out. Fairfax is working on a Climate Emergency Resolution. This will move to the Council on January 16<sup>th</sup>.

**Cool The Earth (Carleen).** Cool The Earth is switching its focus to driving electric. The strategy is to develop county-wide collaboration. We are seeking to reach people rapidly and achieve large-scale change. The first phase will target elected officials and thought leaders, creating pressure to build charging stations and to motivate TAM to act. The second phase will be a consumer-facing campaign and a proposal to MCE to integrate a behavior-change model. This effort will incorporate plug-ins, Drawdown efforts.

**Sierra Club (Ed).** The Clean Coalition is seeking to reform the transmission access charge, a market distortion that favors centralized, remote generation. This increases the burden and serves as a roadblock to investment in DERs. It will also address CAISO and CPUC legislation.

Doug: This is part of the “headwind of costs.”

Ed (cont.): It increases the head start enjoyed by investor-owned utilities. And Diablo Canyon is a welfare program for workers. Shut it down early.

**Sustainable Organizations (Bill, San Rafael).** San Rafael is coming to the conclusion of its CAP revision, with adoption anticipated early next year. The revised CAP will be a model for other jurisdictions and will also tie in to the San Rafael General Plan. The steering committee is aware of issues regarding climate and sea level rise due to vigorous advocacy. There has been pushback re costs imposed on affordable housing. There are projects proposed for concentrated infill housing near transportation. These proposals include one for Northgate (which has been reduced by half) and a project at Seagate in San Rafael. We seek housing in the right place and right quantity.

Daisy: An Environmental Forum presentation indicated that much of San Rafael will be flooded.

**Sustainable Organizations (Ed, Novato).** The film “Rebels with a Cause” will be shown at the Novato City Hall on December 6 at 6:00.

Sarah: MCL is also a sponsor. The directors will be in attendance. There will be an Environmental Forum event on Wednesday, “Bridging the Great Divide: Can We Work Together for a Healthy Environment? Speakers include Jared Huffman, Arlie Hochschild, and Mark Hertsgaard.

**Indivisible Marin (Sue).** Indivisible Marin is focused on a campaign to be able to plug in EVs anywhere, and a campaign for a democratic congress. It is partnering with Cool the Earth and plans to meet with Rep. Marc Levine and Sen. Mike McGuire. Our mantra is to pressure officials regarding climate change. Smoke from the wildfires increases the energy for change, but both government and individual behavior change move slowly.

Next month’s meeting will take place on December 21.

The MCL Holiday party will be held on December 7.

Meeting adjourned 11:05.

Minutes: PN.