

MARIN CONSERVATION LEAGUE

Climate Action Working Group: February 16, 2018

Muir Woods Conference Room, 175 N. Redwood Blvd., San Rafael

Present: Co-Chairs Doug Wilson and Pam Reaves, Bill Carney, Tamra Peters, Ed Mainland, Pat Nelson, Helene Marsh, Dale Miller, Heather Furnidge, Nancy Bell, David Kunhardt, Nona Dennis, Norma Fragoso, Bob Miller, Judy Teichman, Dale Miller, Leslie Alden, Carleen Cullen, Tom Flynn, Judy Ford, Robert Gould, Belle Cole, Andrea Taylor, Cory Bytof, Monica DiLillo, Maureen Parton, Judy Schriebman, Judy Ford.

Guest Speakers: Chris Choo, Principal Watershed Planner, Marin County Dept. of Public Works.

Co-Chair Doug Wilson called the meeting to order at 9:07.

Brief Introductions

Agenda and Minutes

The agenda was adopted by consensus, with revision.

The January minutes were approved by consensus, with corrections.

Discussion 1: BayWAVE Part 2 and County Planning for Sea Level Rise (Chris Choo)

Doug introduced Chris Choo, noting that Marin Conservation League has been following the progress of the first phase of BayWAVE, the vulnerability assessment. Marin has been “doing it right” in its effort to address sea level rise. The County saw the issue coming and has been addressing it in an orderly way, forming C-SMART to address sea level rise on Marin’s ocean coast and BayWAVE to address sea level rise on the Bay coast. Chris has spoken before on the vulnerability study phase of BayWAVE and will update us now.

Chris: The County has in place several efforts to address climate change. It is addressing both climate change mitigation and sea level rise. C-SMART and BayWAVE sea level rise efforts consider both adaptation and resilience.

BayWAVE has finalized the vulnerability study that considers effects of sea level rise on the natural and built environment under various scenarios of sea level rise and storm events: 10 different sea levels (ranging from 0 to 200 inches) and 4 storm severities (none, annual, 20-, 100-year storm surges).

Phase 1 identified what will be inundated under the various scenarios. The vulnerability assessment is the foundation Marin to begin planning for adaptation. Under Phase 2, the County is considering how to plan a response to the scenarios previously identified. The problem is complex because of the nature of water and drainage and the uncertainty regarding the ultimate

extent of sea level rise. There will be access problems for all of us under the various scenarios. Phase 2 is a multijurisdictional effort encompassing adaptation strategies and community outreach. The County has an ongoing effort to expand engagement by using community partnerships and a range of tools such as the Game of Floods and a community-science field station at the edge of Richardson Bay.

The County is now developing guidance and policies to govern the unincorporated areas under its jurisdiction. This effort is in the research phase. The Department of Public Works (DPW) is planning in collaboration with other agencies. The guidance will address land use, considering adaptation and available tools.

The effort acknowledges the County's limited ability to mandate actions regarding land use. Opportunities for adaptation are limited by what we have already built. For existing land uses, change may be triggered by remodels. There is relatively little new building in Marin. The County is reviewing permits for parcels in the buffer zone.

DPW is engaged in capital planning, a plan-and-invest effort addressing roads and upgrades to pipes among other projects. In the short term, the County is posing questions to permittees. In the long term, it is planning for disaster under high-sea-level-rise scenarios—for example, elevating Hwy 101 and communities near the highway. The County will work on issues by means of regulation and education.

As in Phase 1, the County will implement collaboration among its own agencies and coordinate with Marin cities and towns as well as regional agencies and FEMA. Marin is on a parallel track with San Mateo County, and San Francisco and Alameda Counties are also conducting similar efforts. This enables the County to utilize parallel studies and facilitates efficiency in use of grant funding. Issues under consideration are zoning changes and elevation of infrastructure.

Marin's operational landscape includes watersheds and baylands, subtidal areas extending to the limit of brackish water. Marin has five watersheds. There are issues of sediment transport and the depth of the Bay at the shore.

The County's FY 2017- 18 Proposed Budget includes a one-time allocation of \$375,000 to support Phase 2 of the BayWAVE initiative. The BayWAVE initiative will benefit from grants of Marin Community Foundation. Under a \$195,000 grant to Marin Audubon for the Tiscornia Marsh project, parties will address potential flooding and habitat degradation in San Rafael's Canal Area, near Pickleweed Park. The project will include engineering improvements to a degraded levee, efforts to stabilize and restore an eroding tidal marsh with nature-based strategies such as horizontal levees, and community outreach. The project reflects an effort to focus on disadvantaged communities. Under a \$203,000 grant, Point Blue will work with the San Francisco Estuary Institute and the County of Marin's Community Development Agency on nature-based climate change adaptation strategies such as oyster beds and horizontal levees.

The County is utilizing demonstration projects such as the Roger Levanthal project on Aramburu Island, which included a constructed bay beach as a natural approach to mitigate shoreline erosion. There are several small projects adding fill to mitigate shoreline erosion, including one

at Blackie's Pasture. Measure AA will provide funding for the ongoing Deer Island Project, a part of the Novato Basin Dredging Sediment Beneficial Reuse Demonstration Project. This project focuses on creating levees that serve as a transition zone between high marsh and upland vegetation. Gas tax funding will enable efforts to address flooding in the Manzanita area. This effort is at the conceptual stage and will be brought back to the public.

Comments and Questions

Doug: Preliminary studies contemplate a 25-30 year time horizon. Eventually, Marin will have to conduct land use planning with much less land. If all of the polar ice melts, sea level rise will reach 200 feet. Sewage plants will be under water. A. Near-term solutions are nature-based. There is also some long-term capital planning under the sea-level-rise umbrella. We are prepared for up to three feet of sea level rise. Over three feet, we are in trouble. There are a lot of moving parts.

Doug: There is Shoreline Hwy to consider, as well as Hwy 101. And elevating Manzanita will be problematic because safety standards require that you also raise Hwy 101 above it. Impacts to utilities affect the entire community. A. Resilient by Design is bringing together a diverse cross-section of expertise in a Resilient Bay Area project. This is modeled after the Rebuild by Design effort that was launched after Hurricane Sandy. Resilient by Design was launched a year with funding from the Rockefeller Foundation. There are ten teams from nine counties working to come up with innovative ideas. Marin has two teams, one of which (Bionic) is focusing on the Canal area in San Rafael. That team's short-term goals include protecting the Community Center. Long-term, they are thinking about how water moves through the community. The goal is to maximize wetlands. They are considering solutions such as undergrounding Hwy. 101, rerouting SMART and the Richmond Bridge. They are going out into the community, conducting interviews and bringing in the community's thoughts. The goal of the teams is to leave us with ideas that might be replicable around the Bay Area.

David: We should acknowledge our frustration with the scope of the problem. It is hard to communicate dollars and impacts vis-à-vis feet of sea level rise. A. In the Vulnerability Assessment, there is imperfect quantification and many factors. The challenge is to conduct a bigger discussion in the face of anger and frustration.

Judy T.: What is the second Marin Team? A. The second team, Common Ground, is looking at Hwy 37 and San Pablo Bay. Sears Point is also within the scope of their study, as well as Richmond and Vallejo. They are looking for solutions to address failing infrastructure, possible liquefaction, and increasingly frequent flooding. They are conducting interviews with experts and community members. Re Hwy 37, they are looking at relocating the highway and greatly increasing ferry service.

Pam located information regarding the Architects at School project recently conducted at Laurel Dell School on her iPad and passed it around for the group to review. She noted that this project also addressed the whole design of the Canal Area, with the students participating.

Chris: The County wants to bring more people into the process. [Chris asked members to contact her with ideas and input.]

Bill: What level of sea level rise is the County planning and designing for? For example, if it is six feet, design for that and focus the discussion there: what it means and what we need to protect. If it's 200 feet of sea level rise, we can't design for it now, but put it on the planning maps. This gives context for planning.

Judy S.: Are you looking at connecting the study to upstream effects? A. The state is working on that. There is also discussion in the county re fire and flooding. There are more specific projects addressing the creeks. It's expensive to tie it into the Bay.

Bob: Cooperation is important. The guidance focuses more on the county. Is there a structure to tie in the cities? A. The County has jurisdiction over the unincorporated areas. Some cities have asked the County to coordinate. The County is a forum, not a hammer.

Nona: The Marin Conservation League's March-April newsletter will feature an article on this issue.

Doug: Thank you. This is just the start. All work is needed to lay the groundwork for civil problem-solving in the face of frustration and resistance.

Discussion 2: Reaching consensus on what to do as a county to follow up on Drawdown and MCAN efforts (all)

Doug: How do we "up our game"? What is the best way to structure inclusive participation, bring in new groups, such as Chambers of Commerce, religious groups, schools? We need to respond, reach out into the community, get ideas, conduct preliminary talks. No single group can do it.

Leslie: The County's Drawdown event was based on the Paul Hawken book of the same title. Under the adaptation piece, we all have to be engaged. This was the impetus for MCE, which has made a dent re electricity usage. Transportation is another huge piece. The County Climate Action Plan has evolved from the County reporting out re unincorporated areas; it's morphing into a community-wide campaign. Relevant developments include the formation of the Marin Climate Action Network. How do we get to fossil-free? Strategic topic areas aligned to state priorities. The task of creating climate-resilient communities has many facets.

Monica: [Monica noted that she is assisting Supervisors Connolly and Sears.] The Climate Action Working Group is a resource. MCAN has been meeting with Supervisors Connolly and Sears. Various participants have been working together in conjunction with the budget process. Cautionary note: A five percent budget cut is contemplated in light of federal developments. The County is a hub. The structure for collaboration is developing.

Robert: The problem is how to coordinate and organize the stakeholders, designing a collaborative framework. We are working on conceptual drafting and will present a model to the

County. This will entail working groups and roadmaps for strategic areas. People will not be working in siloes.

Doug: We should involve as many people and groups as possible.

David: Each organization has its own path and pace regarding how it contributes. For example, MCL is noted for its intellectual leadership.

Andrea: The recent Transformative Resilience Conference emphasized the need to support each other. CERT (Community Emergency Response Team) is a connection. They take on problems at a neighborhood level and provide emotional resilience training. Perhaps MCL could invite CERT to participate and provide a model for communication at the local level.

Doug: CERT operates in West Marin.

Judy T. and Heather: CERT is a good idea. In West Marin, people know that people in the community have to take care of themselves because they are the last to be served by government resources.

Nancy: Marin Disaster Council and Shore Up Marin have an emergency response bottom line. These organizations provide a different cast of characters. Judy Arnold heads.

Leslie: On the adaptation side, Drawdown is a good model: "Here is something we can do." This is the other piece, giving people hope by identifying something they can do now. A change of habits based on knowledge.

Maureen: Also at the conference, with CERT, the Resilient Neighborhoods approach. It's important to meet people where they are: "Nothing about us without us." All traumas and challenges are incorporated. For example, the response to Hurricane Sandy, the church network in San Francisco's Hunter's Point.

Dale: Reduce conflicting, outdated messages. For example, promotion of hybrid cars and outdated information stating that electricity is the major source of GHG pollution.

Doug: Provide education and expand the conversation.

Tamra: Adaptation and resilience are now part of the Resilient Neighborhoods program. Resilient Neighborhoods addresses emergency response and preparedness.

Nona: One model is the Firewise program, which has a brilliant specific set of protocols and a coordinating council.

Reports

Resilient Neighborhoods (Tamra): One team persisted through the holidays and has graduated, the Drawdown Carbon Collective. Resilient Neighborhoods has incorporated Drawdown

numbers and has turned in a marketing plan to the California Energy Commission (CEC). Resilient Neighborhoods has worked with 389 households and 952 people, and has eliminated more than 4 ½ million pounds of annual CO2 emissions. FIRESafe Marin protocols have been incorporated in the program. Food choices have been added to the toolkit. Utilizing its carbon footprint calculator, Resilient Neighborhoods would like to educate participants with more numbers from West Marin ranchers—to coordinate with the ranchers and support them based on the numbers.

Andrea: Is there a map of the households that have participated?

EVs (Dale): Some elements needed to facilitate the transition to electrification are not there. There is CEC grant funding available for EV planning, but no agency in the county has the resources to apply. A coalition of advocates has been pulled together and is meeting to advance three priorities: EV infrastructure, changes in building codes, and education/outreach. They are looking at the whole picture. Anyone who would like to get involved, let Dale know.

The County has developed a first version of its proposed new green building code. Provisions to support EVs are part of the proposed code, including constructing EV-capable new buildings and mandating a percentage of EV-ready spaces in new parking lots (with additional spaces EV-capable).

EV outreach is now targeting realtors. There is a need to counter the myth created by Southern California Edison that the grid cannot handle total electrification. There is a program in Southern California to promote EV purchases by providing substantial reductions in the price of a BMW i3. Work is ongoing for the Earth Day Green Building Exposition in Santa Rosa.

Deep Green (Helene): Helene noted that she had just returned from a trip taking her mother back to the mudslide area in Southern California and has returned with renewed conviction after seeing the devastation. The Feb. 21st meeting of the Ross Valley Sanitation District meeting has Deep Green on the agenda. If they go Deep Green, they would be first independent district to do so. Members are invited to come to the meeting and advocate.

Environmental Forum of Marin (David): The Forum will be co-hosting an event on The Future of Transportation on March 14th at 6:30. Location: Bio Marin in San Rafael. There will be three speakers Molly Cohen D'Agostino, Carleen Cullen, and Jon Haveman. Sup. Damon Connolly will give opening remarks, and Stephanie Moulton-Peters will introduce and moderate the panel.

The Forum will also present a lecture on Getting to 100% Clean Energy, as part of its lecture series. The lecture will take place on February 27 at 7:00 at the Presbyterian Church in San Rafael. The keynote speaker is Dan Reicher.

Lead On Climate (Bill and Belle): The next event, Reaching Paris Without Stopping in Washington, will take place on September 15, 2018, the day after the Governor's global climate action summit. Christiana Figueres will be one of the speakers. Planning is underway. Locations being considered include College of Marin. Lead on Climate is coordinating with the state. The

event will showcase what is happening in Marin, with an opportunity for organizations to describe their efforts.

Sierra Club (Ed): The Marin Board of Supervisors conducted the first hearing on the update of the Green Building Ordinance. Ed's Evaluation: Does it move the needle? Yes. Does it fully encompass needs and developments? No. If all of the cities adopt it, it will be an incremental improvement, but it's not commensurate with the scale of the problem. Ed suggested that the County host a charrette. This is a once-in-10-years opportunity and a central piece in the Drawdown strategy. The treatment of EV infrastructure in the ordinance should be improved.

Leslie: This is a key point. The climate is moving fast, and they only update the ordinance every 10 years. The Supervisors suggested changes and directed staff to come back with improvements. This issue requires more thought. Send comments to Dana Armanino, Brian Crawford, and Alice Zammiller, and include the Supervisors as well.

Q. What about the timing? There would be months of work around the EV issues.

Ed: A charrette is an orderly, professional way to bring together ideas and obtain constructive community participation.

Dale: The County is limited by state requirements. Look at how to work with the state requirements to use natural gas. Lobby at the state level.

Leslie: Identify impediments.

Sustainable Organizations (Bill): We're in the trenches, on committees in the city. The San Rafael Climate Change Action Plan (CCAP) revision for 2030. The Steering Committee for the San Rafael General Plan 2040 revision. Parking issues. There is a large project on the Bio Marin site, bringing jobs and housing to the same site, as well as Whistlestop. Concerning transportation, there are major opportunities: a carbon tax, Regional Measure 3 on the June ballot, a November effort to roll back the gas tax, Local Measure A supporting transportation.

Getting to 100% GHG-Free Energy in Marin (Bob): There's an article on renewable energy in Marin in the newsletter. The question is: Why not 100% renewable now? What are the practical difficulties? I interviewed contract people and lawyers at MCE. It's an ongoing project. Doug and Sarah are working on it as well.

Doug: It's a complex situation.

North Bay Forward (Judy F.): Interfaith Power & Light and Sustainable North Bay have a joint initiative, a series of working group charrettes. These are working lunches on the last Monday of the month, taking a watershed approach, emphasizing natural systems. The Green Expo next weekend will address rebuilding after the fires.

Judy T.: Judy Ford and the Bionic Team will be speaking at the MCL Land Use Committee meeting on March 7, at 9:00.

Andrea: There is a meeting on March 9 to report on the ongoing carbon lawsuit in which Marin County, San Mateo County, and the City of Imperial Beach are seeking compensation from major fossil fuel companies for the current and future costs of adapting to sea level rises linked to climate change. A lawyer from Earthjustice will report, and there will be an artistic rendition of climate change. New York is also mounting a similar lawsuit.

Legislative Update (Pat): Pat passed around a recent IJ article reporting that the Canal district has been selected for a Sea Level Rise study.

CPUC Resolution E-4907 (Pam, Ed, Doug): Four MCL people attended the February 8 meeting at the CPUC, in which a favorably amended resolution was voted on and adopted. In response to a flood of public comment, the draft resolution that would have interfered with the formation of new CCAs and created an effective freeze was amended and issued to the public very shortly before the meeting. The amended resolution still imposes new procedural requirements on new CCAs, but the CCAs now forming will be allowed to proceed. The resolution applies only in the 2018-2019 time period, after which cost-shifting issues will be addressed in appropriate formal proceedings as requested by CCA supporters. The changes demonstrate that the PUC pays attention to angry protesters.

PG&E and the electricians local were in attendance. Ed noted that speakers included the electeds from all of the CCA jurisdictions. Ed suggested that CCA electoral power will increase under a new governor and that it would be an effective tactic to stall appointments of new commissioners until a new governor is elected.

Announcements

Belle: On March 11, 3:00 to 5:00, the Marin Leadership Network climate subcommittee will meet. The speaker will be David Kunhardt.

Leslie: Leslie emphasized the value of the events announced at CAWG meetings. She requested that members also send them to her to post. If the event is Drawdown-related, please state that it is conducted in collaboration with Drawdown Marin.

Doug: Dawn Weisz thanked us for the letter that we sent to MCE.

Pam: At the board meeting last night, I contacted Andrew McCollough. He asked about the letter.

Leslie: I'm glad for the participation at meetings, which has increased recently.

Doug: Sarah, Bob, Pam, and Doug will be coming up with a questionnaire.

David: EPA will be holding a listening session on the Trump Administration's proposed repeal of the Clean Power Plan on February 28 at the San Francisco main library. Speakers need to sign up for time slots.

Doug: The California Summit and Exposition on Climate will be held on April 9-10 in Sacramento.

The next CAWG meeting will be on March 16. Possible topics for discussion include directions for the future and building codes.

Meeting adjourned 11:22.

Minutes: PN.