

MARIN CONSERVATION LEAGUE
Climate Action Working Group: December 5, 2014
San Rafael Corporate Center, Tamalpais Room

Present: Co-chairs Pam Reaves and Doug Wilson; also Tamra Peters, Bill Carney, Kate Powers, Nona Dennis (until 9:45), Susan Robinson, Ed Mainland, Steve Turitzin, Bob Spofford, Tom Flynn, David Haskell, Kiki LaPorta, Cory Bytof, Judy Teichman, Jana Haehl, and Heather Furmidge

Doug opened the meeting at 9:09.

Quick Intros: Attendee introductions.

Approval of the Agenda: No additions. Agenda approved.

Approval of October 31, 2014 Minutes: Minutes Approved.

Presentation of long-term plan for energy efficiency programs at Marin Clean Energy: Alice Stover, MCE Energy Efficiency Program Specialist

Alice presented an overview of MCE's proposed, rate payer funded, 2016 energy efficiency program designs. It is currently in draft form as preparation of an application submitted to CPUC for funding. The document "overview packet" is available for comment on MCE's website by clicking on the "Energy Savings" tab. Deadline for public comment to be incorporated in next MCE document is end of January.

<http://www.mcecleanenergy.org/energy-savings/>

MCE's strategy is to try to understand customer perspective and the trigger points of when energy efficiency upgrade decisions in homes and businesses may be made. Community feedback was gathered from workshops. MCE's goal is to be single point of contact for advice and technical info on all energy efficiency options available, currently only available for multifamily units.

One exception of another good route for assistance is:

Home UpGrade Hotline, sponsored by Bay Area Regional Energy Network.

<https://www.bayareaenergyupgrade.org/>

(866) 878-6008

Currently there is not a lot of return on investment unless building is the size of a large multi-family. Large buildings like co-ops or senior housing, where units are not individually metered but split a percentage of building's total bill, lack incentives.

Cory - If you don't have ROI, need another incentive. If there is not an environmental incentive, you need a financial incentive. Alice - MCE is looking at rebate incentives.

Currently all MCE energy efficiency programs are paid for through CPUC which collects public service fees from all energy customers for energy efficiency. MCE does not use any of their operating funds to fund efficiency. MCE's customers pay public service fees like other energy customers. The 2013-14 budget for MCE's energy efficiency programs was \$4 million, the smallest budget compared to other utilities.

An economic problem with investor owned utilities running energy efficiency programs is

decoupling. Rates are set by costs with allowances for recovery with guaranteed percentages of profit. CPUC incentivizes energy efficiency programs with shareholder bonuses for meeting goals. However, MCE is not a for-profit operation, so it does not receive any bonuses.

Bill – One way to increase the effort might be for jurisdictional building codes to require energy efficiency upgrades during permitting processes and MCE could build in incentives then. Bill expressed concern that we're not going to get to the change we need by the time we need it through one-on-one efforts.

Alice's email is astover@mcecleanenergy.org

Presentation by CAWG Energy Efficiency Subcommittee (Task Force): Ed Mainland

Subcommittee members are Ed, Kiki La Porta, David Haskell, Bob Spofford, Tom Flynn, Steve Turitzin. Peter Waring also attended meetings.

The group met twice. Additionally, Kiki and David hosted a salon on energy and energy efficiency. The group sees their mission to come up with recommendations that 1) would help enable MCL Board to focus advocacy on issue, 2) to guide CAWG and MCL on useful input to MCE's Energy Efficiency programs, and 3) to prepare individuals or MCL to continue the dialogue with MCE's staff and to hold a working meeting with the policymakers of MCE, technical committee members or Board of Directors.

Energy efficiency is the focus because it is the cheapest and quickest way to reduce GHG emissions and find renewable energy resources. Ed passed out a chart and the subcommittee's working outline (with footnotes) titled "Why and How Marin Can Accelerate Energy Efficiency". It lists basic propositions for CAWG to debate, and short and long term policy advocacy specifics to discuss.

Delivery programs for energy efficiency are fragmented. The State puts energy efficiency as one of its prime means of fulfilling its climate goals and its renewable energy goals. MCE in its mission has two ways of reducing GHG's; one of those is through energy efficiency. Currently MCE's efficiency effort is small compared to their clean energy procurement efforts.

Action item: Ed will make outline, with specifics asking for input, available for circulation to MCL Board and others. Additionally, Bill suggested Ed start a draft letter of suggested comments to MCE's proposed 2016 Energy Efficiency programs for MCL to review and for other groups represented at CAWG meetings to review and modify to draft their own comments.

David mentioned that the Public Goods Charge was replaced by the Electric Program Investment Charge (EPIC). David presented his "Energy Efficiency White Paper", an overview of EPIC and the role of energy efficiency. He said energy efficiency is the most important tool we have to prevent climate catastrophe. The new energy world is made up of distributive capacity generation; energy efficiency as a climate protection tool (versus a utility tool to keep energy prices at reasonable levels) is a new paradigm, and we must make policy regulations that make significant changes. David mentioned the importance of former BERST (Building Energy Retrofit

and Solar Transformation) initiative promoted by Bob Brown.

Doug discussed MCL's role as linking thoughtful perspective with practical and focused recommendations that decisionmakers can specifically use. He also said that MCL requires that their advocacy go through an evaluative process.

Alice related some resources from California Energy Industry meeting, (real world examples of David's big picture thinking of moving away from top down approach and how to sell energy efficiency on a larger scale)--A substation in Brooklyn needed expensive updating and the utility instead decided to contract out for demand reduction and get bids on energy efficiency, an example of the future of energy efficiency efforts. She also mentioned an article on Green Tech Media blog "Why are top-down energy efficiency programs so expensive?"

Kiki suggested that energy efficiency is an arcane and abstract concept that many do not understand and asked if it would be appropriate for MCL Board to hear a presentation on energy efficiency to elevate literacy on what is at issue.

Ed said these are important and noble issues for MCL to engage in and advocate for. Tamra suggested that the different environmental groups use their clout, and knowledge and experience to work together with MCE and the County to move things forward. Alice requested the group focus on the immediate energy efficiency program plans for 2016 first.

Bob stated that the topic takes us into what is the role of government. And those discussions should be held until after January 30th.

Reports:

1) Sustainable groups – (Bill Carney)

Board of Supervisors approved \$250,000 for Vulnerability Assessment funding on November 4. So far there has been no specificity for how the money will be spent. He expressed concern over the possibility of fragmenting the total, adding this is an opportune moment to do holistic thinking around climate impacts. Bill would like to see the \$250,000 as a stimulus to get additional funds, through MCEP, from City jurisdictions to turn seed money for assessment into qualifying for larger funding to produce a plan and implement a plan. He would like to see a public discussion on how money is spent so it is not spent on siloed efforts.

350 Marin and Sustainable San Rafael working with MCEP on effort to do a score card on effectiveness of Climate Action Plans around the County. Event in January postponed.

350 Marin is working on an event in January based on the film, "The Future of Energy". The trailer for the film <http://vimeo.com/83014869>, the teaser <http://vimeo.com/85506584>. There may be possibility for other groups to get involved or sponsor event.

Bill suggested reaching out to a 350 Marin member and Golden Gate Electric Vehicle Association rep. to join CAWG.

2) Marin Climate Energy Partnership (Cory Bytof)

San Rafael was beneficiary of testing BCDC's "Adapting to Rising Tides". It's a tool that maps and gathers data that scales up for high level regional planning and scales down for neighborhood-level planning. It can help determine assets and then be used to develop strategies. BCDC looked at housing in San Rafael's transit PDA area, which was expanded to Gerstle Park, Dominican, the Canal Area, and downtown.

Cory said he hopes to help San Rafael move forward with its Local Hazard Mitigation Plan so they can secure funding and participate robustly in vulnerability analysis and assessments.

Cory is current head of Marin Climate and Energy Partnership (MCEP) which is a group made up of staff from all local jurisdictions in Marin, east of Fairfax, and the public utilities, MCE and MMWD, though not sanitation districts. The group tries to implement their respective Climate Action Plans and do greenhouse gas inventories for each jurisdiction. Because of collaboration, the group has been able to leverage funding to work toward adaptation programs in their climate action plans. All cities have buy-in. MCEP has met with County and BCDC about being hosts or conveners of sea level rise and adaptation planning. They have also met with Community Marin and Marin County Council of Mayors and Councilmembers. (MCCMC). Jack Liebster, County Planning Manager, is also working with MCEP.

Marin Community Foundation has four key focus areas in its new strategy. They are Economic Opportunity, Education, Health, and the Environment. These focus areas will all be funded with Buck Fund money. The underlying theme is disadvantaged communities. MCF is currently conducting strategy meetings and public outreach. Cory participated and gave input on the vulnerability assessment collaborations.

Cory commented that the report card mapping on the 350 Marin Climate Action Plans scorecard effort that Bill mentioned is beautiful. However it's limited to data that cities are getting from their Climate Action Plans and greenhouse gas inventories.

Possible topics for the January CAWG agenda were briefly discussed.

Next Meeting: January 9, 9:00–11:00 a.m., at San Rafael Corporate Center Conference Room

Meeting adjourned 11:28 a.m.

Notes: KP